[*PB* 20.2 (2020) 116-133]
https://doi.org/10.1558/prbt.40851

Perfect Beat (print) ISSN 1038-2909
Perfect Beat (online) ISSN 1836-0343

Oki Rahadianto Sutopo
Gregorius Ragil Wibawanto
Agustinus Aryo Lukisworo

Resist or perish! Understanding the mode of resistance among young DIY Indonesian musicians[1]

Oki Rahadianto Sutopo is Executive Director of the Youth Studies Centre and a lecturer in the Department of Sociology within the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences at the Universitas Gadjah Mada (UGM). At UGM, he also holds the position of Head of Undergraduate Sociology Program. His research interests include youth studies, youth culture and sociology of knowledge.

Youth Studies Centre &
Department of Sociology
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Gadjah Mada
Yogyakarta
Indonesia
oki.rahadianto@ugm.ac.id

Gregorius Ragil Wibawanto is a lecturer at the Department of Sociology and researcher with Youth Studies Centre, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences Universitas Gadjah Mada. His research interests include youth studies, contemporary art, media, and education.

Youth Studies Centre &
Department of Sociology
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Gadjah Mada
Yogyakarta
Indonesia
gregorius.ragil.w@mail.ugm.ac.id

Agustinus Aryo Lukisworo is a lecturer in sociology at Universitas Atma Jaya, Yogyakarta. Previously, he worked as Project Officer at Youth Studies Centre, Universitas Gadjah Mada. His research interests are youth culture and metal studies.

Youth Studies Centre &
Department of Sociology
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Gadjah Mada
Yogyakarta
Indonesia
aryo.lukisworo@mail.ugm.ac.id

1. The authors would like to thank all the young metal musicians in Yogyakarta who participated in this project. This research was funded by *Program Rekognisi Tugas Akhir (RTA) 2019*, Direktorat Penelitian Universitas Gadjah Mada.

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021, Office 415, The Workstation, 15 Paternoster Row, Sheffield S1 2BX.

equinoxonline

Abstract

This article examines the practice of resistance among young DIY musicians in Yogyakarta, Indonesia in the context of the post-reform era. DIY young musicians negotiate how to provide for their everyday economic needs while also upholding their music genre's spirit of resistance against market commodification. Lately, commodification not only comes from the music industry but also from the state through neoliberal-oriented creative economy policies. Music falls into the category of a creative sector and is seen as a product to boost economic growth. Based on our empirical data, young musicians resist this through DIY practices in their music scene. We show the struggle of young musicians to sustain their musical values of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*). Instead of viewing resistance as homogenous, we observed three modes of resistance: the *rookie*, the *in-between*, and the *afficionado*, based on their level of commitment to being a DIY careerist. Our research offers a real-world example of theories around popular music and youth studies based on the experiences of young Indonesian musicians.

Keywords: resistance; Do It Yourself (DIY); neoliberalism; young musicians; Indonesia

Introduction

This article narrates the struggle of young musicians in Yogyakarta, Indonesia in trying to maintain their values of 'authenticity' (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*) while also needing to survive economically under the neoliberal state policies and the commodification of their music scene. Looking at the local metal music scene, we found three modes of resistance, namely, '*rookie*', '*in-between*' and '*afficionado*' based on their ability to commit fully to being a DIY careerist.

Recently, societal shifts towards global neoliberal hegemony can be argued as taking over most aspects of everyday life, including how young people reinterpret their participation in the overlapping domains of culture and transition (that is family, education and work) (see Woodman and Bennett 2015). As Bennett (2018) argues, in Western societies, under rising insecure conditions for youth and an uncertain job market, it is important to consider the emerging forms of DIY (Do It Yourself) initiatives among youth and how they maintain the values of resistance (Bennett and Guerra 2018). There has been tension between notions of resistance to capitalism versus entrepreneurial enterprises for DIY careerists, and more analyses of voices and lived experiences from DIY music proponents globally can unpack some of these problematics. Bennett (2018) calls for DIY music experiences to be explored more closely through empirical research.

The emergence of the DIY 'punk' subculture in Indonesia cannot be separated from its temporal location as a form of resistance against the military-based

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

authoritarian regime of the New Order Era (1966–1998).[2] Indonesian punk articulated an alternative to consumption which had become a viable option for many Indonesian youth at that time. The end of the 1990s offered relatively more personal freedoms (Fukuoka 2014) which arguably resulted in more diverse musical expressions by young people. For example, in the case of DIY underground scenes, at the end of the New Order Era, many musicians and DIY scenesters played important roles in the anti-New Order Era protest movement, demanding social and political changes to achieve a more democratic country (Baulch 2002; Wallach 2008; Martin-Iverson 2012). Also at that time, rap music became a medium of self-expression and freedom for urban upper-class youth (Bodden 2005). Many scholars have addressed this phenomenon, not only in the music scene, but in wider fields of cultural production in Indonesia; for example, local and national theatre became alternative spaces of resistance (see Hatley 2008; Bodden 2010) which also helped foment social change.

The socio-historical context of resistance among DIY punk/metal musicians in Indonesia has now changed significantly. Political scientist Bourchier (2019) describes the post-Reformation era in Indonesia as a transition from democratic cosmopolitanism to religious nationalism. In terms of economic systems, political economist Warburton (2016) explains that economic planning manifested in the rise of new developmentalism in 2016, marked by an over-focus on infrastructure and deregulation, and other policy issues were subordinated to those developmentalist goals (2016: 297). Hadiz and Robison (2013) assert that the post-Reformation era embraced neoliberal-style policies and economics combined with a structure of oligarchy. This engendered a shift towards American-style consumerism (Gerke 2002), despite the precarious conditions such as poverty and youth unemployment (Parker and Nilan 2013). Post-reform policy discourse shifted from Keynesian strategies that provided jobs for young people, to an emphasis on the promotion of entrepreneurial skills for young people; that is, the neoliberal idea that they should create their own jobs (Naafs and White 2012: 11).

Lately, the Indonesian government has begun to embrace a 'creative economy policy' as part of their development agenda (Fahmi, McCann and Koster 2015: 1374). Under the Jokowi (the current president) administration, narratives of creative economy policy were strengthened through the establishment of the Creative Economy Agency in 2015 which aims to promote Indonesian creative products including music (Bekraf and Badan Pusat Statistik 2016). Since then,

2. Historically, after a declaration of independence from Dutch and Japan in 1945, Indonesia was ruled by three different regimes: the Old Order Regime ('*Rezim Orde Lama*', 1945–1965), the New Order Regime ('*Rezim Orde Baru*', 1966–1998) and the Reformation Era ('*Era Reformasi*', 1999–).

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

large music festivals sponsored by the agency have been held in big cities, including Yogyakarta. The agency also provides generous financial support for bands who want to expand into international markets. This so-called 'creative economy' has become the dominant development discourse imposed by state agencies in the neoliberal-oriented post-reform Indonesia. Thus, being able to negotiate between their genre/personal values of resistance against neoliberalism, versus having an entrepreneurial DIY career, is even more relevant for contemporary young Indonesian musicians who are trying to maintain values of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*).

In order to acknowledge the voices and lived experiences of DIY musicians from Global South countries, this article responds to Bennett's (2018) invitation to do empirical research through close ethnography of young DIY musicians in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. The article combines conceptual tools from youth studies, sociology and popular music. Based on empirical data, we describe the struggle of young musicians in Yogyakarta who try to sustain a spirit of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*) while needing to survive amidst the hegemonic state 'creative economy' policy and the commodification of music. In the first section, the article maps previous studies on youth, music and DIY careers. The next section looks at the history of metal music scene in Yogyakarta. Finally, we present the narratives of six young musicians showing how they operate in this tension in three modes of resistance, namely the '*rookie*', the '*in between*' and the '*afficionado*'.

Youth, music, resistance and DIY careers

Previous studies on youth, music and DIY careers by youth studies and popular music scholars have found that DIY musicians navigate their way through pursuing their idealistic aspirations to play music and to offer their messages of resistance to commodification, while at the same time having to participate in capitalism in order to survive as well as reach audiences (see Bennett and Guerra 2018).

Bennett (2018: 142) argues that, despite the consequences of the global youth labour market collapse, and the increasingly precarious nature of other labour markets, passion- and leisure-based DIY careers among youth are seen by many as viable options. Arguably, DIY careers are understood by young people in pluralistic ways, not only as resistance against capitalist expansion, but as political expressions through song to articulate culturally grounded messages about social, political and economic crises (Guerra 2020) or which celebrate and represent marginalized identities; for example, Pacific and Māori youth in New Zealand (see Zemke 2007), and local Balinese in Indonesia (see Baulch 2004). However, Bennett (2018: 143) argues that with increasing professionalism and entrepreneurialism in DIY production, the distinction between DIY and mainstream cultural practices has become

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

increasingly blurred. In contrast, according to empirical research in Australia's DIY scenes, Threadgold (2018: 156) found that many young people 'choose poverty' and strategically make decisions to 'keep overheads low' in order to free up temporal and mental space to continue to be creative. Furthermore, in contrast to formal employment, these DIY proponents' aspirations were not necessarily expressed in terms of simply amassing material profit, but merely to have enough capital to invest further in their creative and cultural pursuits (Threadgold 2018: 168).

Haenfler's (2018) study on 'straightedge' DIY musicians in the USA, the UK, Australia and Europe found that their rebellion-oriented punk musical practices played an important role as a provider of practical skills for them, more useful in their lives than those from formal education and work institutions. Sutopo, Threadgold and Nilan (2017) showed how young DIY musicians in Indonesia acquired social and cultural capital through live performances, which facilitated these young indie and jazz musicians to achieve long-term viable music careers. Umney and Kretsos' (2015) study of early-career jazz musicians in London found that musicians' ability to manage precarious economic conditions were affected by structural factors such as class. In particular, those from a wealthier background had greater agency (Umney and Kretsos 2015: 329). Tarassi's (2018) study of Italy's independent music scene in Milan found that musicians had to multi-task, taking on extra non-music jobs in order to survive financially. To summarize, the survival, economic and career strategies of DIY musicians around the globe are enmeshed in the complexities of social, cultural and historical context. The following section provides a summary of previous studies about young DIY musicians in Indonesia.

Under conditions of rapid social change, particularly the embracing of neoliberalism, Martin-Iverson's (2012) work on punk DIY careers—the scenesters—in the underground scene in Bandung, Indonesia highlighted the contradiction of *kemandirian* (autonomy) being anti-neoliberal, but at the same time also reflecting neoliberal values of individualism. In addition, the supposed sub-cultural 'underground' autonomy has also been closely associated with economic precariousness, exploitation and commercialization (Martin-Iverson 2012: 394). Martin-Iverson (2014) found that *anak* DIY (DIY kids) practised the values of both *kemandirian* (autonomy) and *komunitas* (community) through musical performances and distinct organizational practices. The connection between punk music hardcore aesthetics and DIY values was not inherent in their performances as isolated acts, but rather was established through the intersubjective relations of a DIY hardcore show and the wider DIY hardcore community (Martin-Iverson 2014: 184). Moog's (2020) work on a punk rock anarchist collective in Bandung, Indonesia unravelled the implications of DIY and anarchist ethics enacted through both routine interactions and global trans-locality. He argues that the punk rock anarchist collectives

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

resist hegemonic power dynamics, in part, through the very structures they seek to circumvent (Moog 2020: 4). On the other hand, Sutopo, Nilan and Threadgold (2017) saw young musicians struggling to maintain a balance between the sustainability of their DIY careers and being able to provide 'rice on the table', which reflected the lack of a welfare system and a neoliberal mantra of 'survival of the fittest' in Indonesia. Luvaas (2013) found that young people in the Bandung and Yogyakarta DIY music scenes actively participated in the process of production of music products, clothing design and zines to add to their music income. They built social networks and creatively commodified DIY aesthetics and ideologies into profit accumulation, thereby incorporating some neoliberal elements. Luvaas (2013) states that the adoption of a global punk DIY ethos among young middle-class Indonesian musicians is part of their efforts to redefine their class position at a national level.

The research in this article differs to the previous findings mentioned, by naming three modes of resistance, the '*rookie*', the '*in-between*' and the '*afficionado*' based on musicians' commitment to the scene values of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*).

Research methods

This article used ethnography to understand how young musicians constructed the meaning of music and scene participation as a part of their everyday life and how their socio-cultural locations impacted their experiences (Denzin and Lincoln 2008), highlighting that the social world is constantly in 'the making' (Elliot 2005). This article draws on fieldwork conducted from April to August 2019 by the authors in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, a city with a strong milieu of culture, education and activism. Data was gathered through in-depth interviews and participant observation. The in-depth interviews tried to give space to the voices of the young musicians themselves. Sixty informants were recruited based on the authors' own knowledge of insiders in the metal music scene in Yogyakarta. The in-depth interviews were conducted using Javanese, the local language. The musicians were interviewed for approximately two hours each, in locations such as music studios, musicians' boarding houses and in venues after gigs.

Participant observation allowed the researchers to be critical insiders (see Hodkinson 2005), to interact and observe young musicians in their everyday lives, both on and off stage. The authors' status as insiders in the Yogyakarta DIY music scene since the mid-2000s gave strategic access, and hopefully, enabled trust. The researchers also wrote field notes and took photos. The researchers applied a local approach called *nongkrong*, which involves sharing space together and passing time with others. This was useful to build interpersonal chemistry and friendliness

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

(Sutopo 2019: 81). Similarly, in a non-Indonesian context, Clinton and Wallach (2016: 38) found that '"Hanging out and talking metal", was central to achieving scenic cohesion fundamental to the entire concept of a heavy metal community'. These activities play a crucial role in the scene's economies of desire and prestige. Our interviews were transcribed and translated into English by the authors. The intended meanings of the informants were rigorously attempted.

The metal scene in Yogyakarta: A space of the contingent cadence

From the end of the Indonesian New Order regime to the contemporary post-Reformation period, the city of Yogyakarta witnessed a rapid growth in their independent music scene (see Wallach 2008; Luvaas 2013). The city has long been seen by Indonesians as being able to follow the global and national *zeitgeist* while also maintaining its own distinctiveness. This can be demonstrated in the music in Yogyakarta during the early *reformasi* era (Richter 2012: 94–97). At times, Yogyakarta has been home to a diverse range of music genres, including that of 'traditional' rhythms played at tourism sites, jazz performed for elite audiences at high-class hotels, or popular music heard in cafés and underground scenes. Sutopo and Nilan (2018: 41–44), for example, provide an account of the development of a DIY ethos in the jazz scene in Yogyakarta—from the early 1980s to its hybrid forms in the contemporary era. Luvaas (2009: 92) captured detailed accounts of the changes that have occurred within indie pop scenes, particularly in how the scene members maintained a DIY ethos that successfully created *distros*—DIY shops that sell band merchandise—as their entrepreneurial strategy. These music scenes have their own genre specificities, while also interacting with other fields of cultural production (Bourdieu 1993) such as film, art exhibits and entrepreneurial activities.

The DIY 'punk' musical, economic and cultural practices of youth in Yogyakarta is connected to political activism. During the mobilization to overthrow the former President Soeharto from authoritarian power in 1998, Yogyakarta became a 'city of resistance' through its series of demonstrations and secret discussions inside and outside of the university (Aspinall 2005). Students formed alliances with journalists, artists and musicians to create protest and spread anti-government dissent. Many of these collaborations manifested in protest songs, performing arts or underground periodicals (e.g., zines) that criticized the state and capitalist systems. Yogyakarta has been a site of engagement that has generated productive synergies between higher education, music and art scenes. The inter-relations between various cultural arenas have created a 'mode of resistance' which continues in independent music scenes in post-reform Yogyakarta, including the metal music scene.

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

Yogyakarta has a history of rock and heavy metal music that is relatively different from other big cities in Indonesia. In 1970, young people in Jakarta, Bandung, Semarang, Solo and Medan were already familiar with rock and metal, while in Yogyakarta did not gain popularity until the 1980s. The reason for this ten-year gap was that music producers and radio directors in Yogyakarta's local industry were not interested in metal music. There was only one heavy metal band from Yogyakarta that competed in the national metal festival, and they won an award in 1986. However, slowly, the scene started to grow when Yogyakarta was chosen to be the host of the 7th Indonesian Rock Festival in 1993.

The 1993 festival coincides with the growth of *imagined metal communities*—as Wallach (2008) put it—that started in the early 1990s. These communities were fragmented in some urban areas in Yogyakarta, including some based at universities. Heavy metal and other metal genres, including thrash metal, death metal, grind core and black metal (extreme metal), had begun to develop in the city (see Kahn-Harris 2007; Wallach 2008). As the listener numbers expanded, cassette stores and music studios also grew in numbers. Those two places became a meeting point for young people and provided a sense of community and collectivity. Young people started to form their own bands, playing in school festivals and other public events such as Independence Day. This was before self-organized gigs became popular (Lukisworo and Sutopo 2017: 583). The loud music caught the attention of religion leaders and government figures who publicly decried metal music and deemed the sound as against their 'development' agenda (see Baulch 2003). On many occasions, metal bands were even suppressed by police. This anti-metal discourse saw school festivals and public events avoiding extreme metal music on their stages. Ever since then, metal artists have created their own community and organized their own stages (Lukisworo and Sutopo 2017).

The first extreme metal community of Yogyakarta was established in 1995 with the name of Jogjakarta Corpse Grinder (JCG). A year later, they organized the first big independent extreme metal festival in Yogyakarta called *Jogja Brebeg* (Jogja Loud). They also ran small gigs in bars and music studios, performing cover songs of metal bands from America and Europe. Some bands started to perform and record their own albums in 1997, followed by further bands, extending the metal scene in Yogyakarta.

As the country began the *reformasi* era in 1998 that led to a more democratic society, the extreme metal scene in Yogyakarta grew exponentially, together with other genres such as pop and dangdut (see Wallach 2008). From the early to mid-2000s, the Yogyakarta independent music scene was dominated by pop-rock bands that were aiming at more 'high production' sounds. This situation saw the extreme metal scene remain in the 'underground' until some of the profit-minded music

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

organizers created a big music festival that covered more diverse genres in 2009, including metal, known as the *Locstock Music Festival* (Lukisworo and Sutopo 2017). This particular festival was not fully independent, as the organizer was financially assisted by large national companies. However, as it gained success, other festivals emerged and started to provide more spaces of performance for metal bands.

The development of metal music in Yogyakarta became more commodified, though privately-funded festivals were not acceptable for all the musicians and fans in the scene, as that kind of practice was seen as not 'independent'. Some of the extreme metal musicians and bands tried to uphold the 'spirit' of being small, independent and autonomous in producing and performing their music. Recently, the challenges for 'independent' metal heads are not only competition from large companies, but also from the state that has embraced neoliberal-oriented policies, as a 'creative economy' discourse. Some bands, including metal bands, received money from a state-funded tour scheme to go to international festivals in America, Europe and Australia. Other metal bands, however, refused the funding as they felt it contravened their value of autonomy. In the next section, we explore the struggle of young musicians in Yogyakarta in trying to counterbalance their values of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*) with their need to survive financially.

Behind the trajectory of entering the scene

> *At the beginning, I just felt that it was cool.*
>
> Tama, musician cum gig organizer

All of the musicians cited in this project embarked on their DIY music journey when they were in junior or senior high school. Influenced by their peers and Western pop music videos aired on MTV in the early 2000s, young musicians started to form their own bands. Tama, a musician and gig organizer, explains:

> At times, I was so innocent. As you might be able to recall yourselves, MTV was once our gateway to Greenday, Blink 182, Sum 41, and all those of bands. I simply used my pocket money to buy a guitar and went to the studio with my friends … I felt like this was my thing because I was not into sport, let alone being the smartest dude in the class. (i/v, Tama, 14 April 2019)

Similarly, Revanda began to pursue music in the late 1990s, when he was in elementary school, inspired by his father's collection of CDs and cassettes, before discovering MTV in the early 2000s when he was in junior high school. He recalls that: 'It was during junior high school that I began to know Limp Bizkit, Korn and Slipknot. I got to see their music videos and became more interested because of the visual appearance I watched on MTV' (i/v, Revanda, 3 May 2019). Putri, a

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

lead singer of an independent band, who was four years younger than Tama and Revanda, had a rather different starting point. Coming from an upper-middle-class family, she had the privilege of accessing the Internet. From her computer, Putri wanted to widen her musical horizons because she found pop music boring at that time:

> I felt so bored listening to all those pop songs, so I started to look into something new. It was the early era of downloading songs from illegal websites to get access to alternative music. Through those portals, I found some Japanese heavy metal records that really amused me. (i/v, Putri, 10 April 2019)

After personal investigations by themselves into musical elements, and gravitating towards the genre and bands they preferred, they set up their first encounters with the local DIY metal scene. At this stage, they began to learn the *doxa* (Bourdieu and Eagleton 1992), which means the attitudes, music skills and ways to maintain the necessary social networks (see Sutopo 2019; Sutopo and Nilan 2018). This scene contact was also the moment in which the interviewees discovered the ideological dimensions of the local metal scene which held values such as autonomy (*kemandirian*) from the music industry.

From our fieldwork notes and interviews, we found that producing records and touring were the way for the musicians to establish their 'name' in the scene, as described by Revanda:

> For me, producing is the basic requirement for a band to be a band and to be recognized within the scene. After that, you can plan a tour to expand your networks and create your own market. Those two, producing a record and doing a tour, are what bands do. So, yes, a tour is a must. (i/v, Revanda, 3 May 2019)

Putri told us that her band had to find their audience both within and outside the metal scene. She contends that: 'what we need is a market for our band Drowned Awake; we have to be heard by everyone and we must be on stage frequently until everybody knows about us. It is a shame if our skills, talent and knowledge are not shared with wider audiences' (i/v, Putri, 10 April 2019). Tama also emphasizes the importance of establishing a wide market: 'the need of a band is to find the audiences and to show the scene that we exist. That's it' (i/v, Tama, 14 April 2019). He expresses his excitement when his band finally achieves what he means, in relation to establishing a market:

> Finally, I become the witness of the historical movement of extreme metal in Jogja, even in Indonesia when me and my band got the chance to play at Jogja Brebeg [one of the biggest metal festivals in Indonesia held in Yogyakarta]. I was feeling so proud at that time. I was telling myself that I had to play the gigs, even though I must pay the registration fee. (i/v, Tama, 14 April 2019)

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

Playing in a genre-centred festival like this, however, comes with limitations. Fans expect certain kinds of riffs, timbre and instrumentation. Genre also consists of both values and musical characteristics (Frith 1996). Ahmad, a well-known young musician in the Yogyakarta metal, punk and noise music scenes, reminds us that: 'This is what the scene wants you to play, you cannot just do what you want to do especially when we talk about the technical element of the music' (i/v, Ahmad, 30 April 2019). A band has to conform to particular techniques and aesthetics in order to be accepted in a scene and, most importantly, to play in the specific genre-centred gigs.

Producing records, touring, and conforming musically, visually and lyrically to genre conventions are a set of limitations that are needed for inclusion and acceptance in the extreme metal scene. These rules, however, can be negotiated depending on the multiple intersecting structural and cultural conditions in which young musicians live. In the next section, we present three types of responses taken by young metal musicians to navigating the conflict between keeping their authentic (*otentik*) and autonomous (*mandiri*) values alive, while also surviving financially.

Arriving at the crossroads: Learning and maintaining values of authenticity and autonomy

> *Honestly, there was a moment when I thought about quitting this; especially when the thought about marriage and having children came up in my mind.*
>
> Ahmad, musician

The above excerpt reflects how young DIY metal musicians have had to rethink, re-evaluate and re-negotiate their lives and career aspirations while maintaining their values of resistance to commodification and controls. The musicians' response to these tensions varied depending on their families' class, networks of peers, and life stage (see Hodkinson 2016). Our research showed three types of responses to their career advancement.

One solution was that some of them were yet to embrace a 'full' transition into a music career and lifestyle. These musicians were still in the university stage of their life and had only been in the metal scene a few years. They were in the phase of attempting to understand the 'rules of the game', as described by Putri, who spends her time improving her musicianship and widening her musical listening:

> Honestly, I started this with no technical background. I realized that music is basically different to that of notes, and within notes there are high pitch, low pitch, and so forth, that I learnt from the music community that I joined at my campus. Also, I feel bad if someone asks me about a song and I don't understand

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

> what song it was. I feel like I have to be able to answer questions about songs. (i/v, Putri, 10 April 2019)

Putri is currently in the phase of exploring music and the potential for a musical career. In Mannheim's words (1952), she is experiencing *fresh contact* with the scene, thus her full transition has not happened yet. Even so, Putri's statement represents the mechanism of the scene to introduce the value of authenticity (*otentisitas*) through deeper understanding of her musical knowledge and the ideologies and capacities of the metal scene, globally and nationally. However, the value of radical autonomy (*kemandirian*) has yet to come up for her. Even though she already has the desire to produce music independently, she does not articulate it into forms of resistance to bigger powers such as state and market commodification. We call this mode of resistance '*rookie*'.

The second possible reconciliation were DIY musicians who were willing to compromise by doing jobs other than music, whether outside or inside the music scene; these folks were reluctant to compromise their artistic expression and chose to reject offers from larger record companies in order to be 'authentic' (*otentik*) to their musical and ideological values. We label this mode of resistance as '*in between*'. For instance, Revanda works as a barista to make a living and on the side produced a record and plays in a band. He refused an offer from a USA label to own the rights for his record for $500. He says that: 'As a musician, this isn't easy work to do; it is fine to be selling out like street vendors if you play pop tunes. This is different. The effort we put into this is way different' (i/v, Revanda, 3 May 2019). He makes a firm stand regarding musical and ethical authenticity:

> To me, the set of rules [*pakem*] in the genre should be followed. If you talk about thrash, you must put a tight and straight beat, right? Then, when you add something different into the music, it would no longer be thrash, no? As so for other genres. (i/v, Revanda, 3 May 2019)

Ahmad and Tama's stories are similar to Revanda's. Ahmad works in quality control at one of Yogyakarta's game developer companies. According to him, the reasons behind his dedication to his music scene is to 'keep this kind of music alive'. This commitment indicates a motive to maintain the aesthetics and artistic elements of his music genre and the scene itself. Tama argues a similar point, saying that 'a musician should show their musicianship, their attitude on and off the stage, as well as their musical references' (i/v, Tama, 14 April 2019). The last point clearly demonstrates his perspective that he must be consistent with his subcultures' value of authenticity. Tama is one young musician who manages to make an actual living from his music scene, as a gig organizer. He thrives on being immersed into the scene:

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

> Underground music has become a part of my spiritual needs. I always feel unsatisfied with what I have been doing with and in my band. I want to contribute more to the scene, that's why I also organize gigs. I feel obliged to invite more people into the environment. It works on some occasions, but sometimes it doesn't. (i/v, Tama, 14 April 2019)

The young musicians interviewed insist that scene participation through music is a non-negotiable part of their lives even though it does not always 'pay the bills'. Interestingly, in Revanda's case, he also worked as an 'at home musician' for some cafés in the city; yet he did not count this job as part of his 'DIY career', as it was not in his preferred metal genre: '[it was] just for money and for fun, different from the music I have been making and investing my time in to'.

The non-negotiable part of young metal musicians' life can also be seen in their attitude towards the neoliberal-oriented programme offered by the State Creative Economy Agency (*Badan Ekonomi Kreatif/BeKraf*). Ahmad's metal band was once asked to participate in this type of programme, but he ultimately refused the offer:

> I had thought about it previously [*BeKraf*'s programme], and at that time we asked our friend who works as a civil servant about any technical matters related to the programme, so he told us about the proposal and presentation in the *BeKraf* office in Jakarta. [...] At first I tried to make a step into it, but later I found there was a hidden government's agenda that will be attached upon us, which I thought would not be relevant for my band. So I choose DIY (Do It Yourself) ways. (i/v, Ahmad, 14 April 2019)

A similar response was also given by Tama, who said that 'I never thought of making a collaboration with the government'. These musicians take their musical resistance (being a part of the 'underground' metal scene) so seriously that they centre other aspects of their life around it, thus employing strategic practices of keeping a balance between domains of 'resistance' and 'surviving' for daily needs. The musicians employed in the '*in between*' mode were willing to do jobs other than music. These '*in between*' musicians took these jobs in order to be free (autonomous) from control of the state creative economy policy and mainstream commodification.

The afficionado

The third type of negotiation between idealism and economic survival among DIY careerists goes beyond the two modes mentioned above. We name this mode '*afficionado*'. These musicians fully embraced the metal musician's life in the scene. They resisted sacrificing their musical idealism to meet industry taste. They had jobs inside the metal scene and gave their labour for the development of the scene. These musicians spent time in various music scenes such as folk, progressive rock, and punk. They had more experiences with the dynamics of the metal scene in

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

comparison to younger members of the scene. Bable is one of these musicians. He comes from North Sumatera and spent most of his teenage life in Yogyakarta in the mid-1990s; both hanging out as well as playing music in the punk scene when he was in junior high school. He first arrived in Yogyakarta in 2001 to pursue his dream of enrolling in a public arts institute. He experienced a *fresh contact*—a first encounter—with Yogyakarta's metal scene. This was the time when underground scene was really 'under the ground' because of the domination of pop songs released by major labels (see Wallach 2008). In the early 2000s, Indonesian popular music was dominated by love songs. He recalls his experiences as upsetting:

> I wanted to go to Java because I want to be in a band, produce a piece, do some recording. But unfortunately, I came in at the wrong 'age'; the dark age of the underground scene! First, it was because of the fact that underground was not there. Second, during the early 2000s, every band wanted to be like all the major label bands, like Sheila on 7, The Rain, Newdays, and those types of band anyway [all pop-rock bands that gained popularity nationwide]. (i/v, Bable, 7 April 2019)

Despite the uncertain prospects of having a stable income, Bable pursued his music dream and studied while searching for the DIY metal underground scene. Bable undertook non-metal related music jobs 'just-for-fun' and 'just-for-money' in cafés from 2005 to 2007. The 'resurrection' of the underground music scene in 2009 through the emergence of metal music festivals and small studio gigs gave him hope and he joined the underground metal scene and formed a band. Bable entered the scene through *nongkrong* activity (Sutopo 2019) in cafés and bars and through attending many gigs. His band's first album was successful, selling a lot of copies, and spawning frequent gigs. Gradually the metal scene became aware of his band. In the same period, he began to run his own music production studio that still exists and has now become a centre for independent music production in Yogyakarta.

In 2015, Bable joined a band outside of the metal scene that played non-metal music. He says that while being in this band, he learned that: 'these two worlds, metal and non-metal, are mutual in characteristics, in that one is beneficial for the other because, for me, its field has its own lack. For example, non-metal independent dudes would not be as dedicated as the metal dudes' (i/v, Bable, 7 April 2019). Bable found that metal musicians were more dedicated to their music and would spend great amounts of time practising the technical and non-technical elements of the music. Even though Bable prefers metal music and the metal scene, his participation in other genres and their scenes has made him want to expand his music tastes and performance:

> That non-metal band I have joined is a professional one. It has been an eye-opening experience. It does really open my eyes because in this non-metal band,

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

> I've learnt lessons about the *indie* scene, about the movement, the politics of the scene and about how to play music that is outside of your comfort zone. It is actually good for your mental health. For example, if we need a reference point for A song, we don't have to be stick around the A. We can sometime go to O or K, or even M. I found it ok to be like that. I became more intense and sensitive to listen to wider genres of music, its history, its scene. And this lesson, I apply it to my metal band. (i/v, Bable, 7 April 2019)

Bable represents an attitude towards authentic practice (*praktik otentik*) that is not confined to the metal musical articulation. His authentic position (*pendirian otentik*) goes beyond the metal scene. His autonomous practice (*praktik kemandirian*) is not only for himself, but also for the whole metal scene. His autonomous practice can be seen in his daily job of running his own recording studio. Through this, he supported and helped many metal bands produce their own albums. The same *collective-autonomous* attitude is shown by Bagus who is a senior drummer in the scene and also works as a graphic artist. Besides playing in a band, he produces artwork for bands in the metal scene. Like Bable, Bagus does not fix his price when it comes to working collaboratively with members of the metal scene. Negotiation and collective decisions are their way of organizing mutual collaborations. Bagus rejects the idea of working with the government through its 'creative economy fund policy' because in his mind 'they never understand the objectives of extreme metal bands; so personally, I never pay any attention to such programmes'. Bagus sees no room for compromise between the government's agenda and the aims of the metal scene.

Both our examples of '*afficionados*', Bable and Bagus, show authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*) in their resistance to the 'state creative economy policy' and what they see as a commodification of their music scene. Their version of authenticity (*otentisitas*) is practised beyond the metal scene and their autonomy (*kemandirian*) is not only for themselves but also for the whole scene. These *collective-autonomous* characteristics are embodied by senior members of the metal scene. In contrast, for the '*rookie*', authenticity (*otentisitas*) remains in a stage of making music sound authentically metal. The second mode (*in-between*) also attempts to make authentic music, but they also try to reject interventions and acquisition from the state and music industry. These three modes of resistance approach the extreme metal values of authenticity (*otentisitas*) and autonomy (*kemandirian*) in differing degrees—but are on a continuum towards resisting the state 'creative economy policy' and the commodification of their metal scene.

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

Conclusion

In the metal scene, we described three versions/modes/levels of resistance to the neoliberal 'creative economy policy' in post-reform Indonesia: the '*rookie*', the '*in-between*' and the '*afficionado*'. Instead of homogenizing resistance, we found it useful to consider degrees of commitments to the genre values. The '*rookie*' is in the process of internalizing scene values which manifested in the practice of doing independent music production. The '*in-between*' facilitates their scene-related resistance, by doing non-music jobs to make a living. For the '*afficionado*', they receive an income only from the independent extreme metal scene. They work for themselves and for the scene, manifesting in *collective-autonomous* values of resistance. Young DIY extreme metal musicians in Yogyakarta showed different levels of approach to and engagement with their scene values of autonomy and authenticity.

References

Aspinall, E. 2005. *Opposing Soeharto: Compromise, Resistance, and Regime Change in Indonesia*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Baulch, E. 2002. 'Alternative Music and Mediation in Late New Order Indonesia'. *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 3/2: 219–34. https://doi.org/10.1080/1464937022000000138

—2003. 'Gesturing Elswhere: The Identity Politics of Balinese Death/Trash Metal Scene'. *Popular Music* 22/2: 195–215. https://doi.org/10.1017/S026114300300312X

—2004. 'Reggae Borderzones, Reggae Graveyards: Bob Marley Fandom in Bali'. *Perfect Beat: The Asia-Pacific Journal of Research into Contemporary Music and Popular Culture* 6/4: 3–27.

Bekraf and Badan Pusat Statistik. 2016. *Data Statistik Ekonomi Kreatif*. Jakarta: Kementrian BUMN.

Bennett, A. 2018. 'Conceptualising the Relationship between Youth, Music and DIY Careers: A Critical Overview'. *Cultural Sociology* 12/2: 140–55. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975517750760

Bennett, A., and P. Guerra, eds. 2018. *DIY Cultures and Underground Music Scenes*. London: Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315226507

Bodden, M. 2005. 'Rap in Indonesian Youth Music of the 1990s'. *Asian Music* 36/2: 1–26. https://doi.org/10.1353/amu.2005.0015

—2010. *Resistance on the National Stage: Modern Theatre and Politics in Late New Order Indonesia*. Ohio: Center for International Studies Ohio University.

Bourchier, D. 2019. 'Two Decades of Ideological Contestation in Indonesia; from Democratic Cosmopolitanism to Religious Nationalism'. *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 49/5: 713–33. https://doi.org/10.1080/00472336.2019.1590620

Bourdieu, P. 1993. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Bourdieu, P., and T. Eagleton. 1992. 'In Conversation: Doxa and Common Life'. *New Left Review* 191: 111–21.

Clinton, E., and J. Wallach. 2016. "Talking Metal: The Social Phenomenology of Hanging Out'. In *Heavy Metal Music and Communal Experience*, ed. Nelson Varas-Diaz and Niall Scott, 37–56. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

Denzin, N. K., and Y. S. Lincoln, eds. 2008. *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*. London: Sage Publications.
Elliot, J. 2005. *Using Narrative in Social Research*. London: Sage Publications. https://doi.org/10.4135/9780857020246
Fahmi, F. Z., P. McCann, and S. Koster. 2015. 'Creative Economy Policy in Developing Countries: The Case of Indonesia'. *Urban Studies* 54/6: 1367–84. https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098015620529
Frith, S. 1996. *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
Fukuoka, Y. 2014. 'Debating Indonesia's Reformasi: Bridging "Parallel Universes"'. *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 44/3: 540–52. https://doi.org/10.1080/00472336.2014.895026
Gerke, S. 2002. 'Global Lifestyles under Local Conditions: The New Indonesian Middle Class'. In *Consumption in Asia: Lifestyles and Identities*, ed. Chua-Beng Huat, 135–58. London: Routledge.
Guerra, P. 2020. 'The Song is Still a "Weapon": The Portuguese Identity in Times of Crises'. *Young: Nordic Journal of Youth Research* 28/1: 14–31. https://doi.org/10.1177/1103308819829603
Hadiz, V., and R. Robison. 2013. 'The Political Economy of Oligarchy and the Reorganization of Power in Indonesia'. *Indonesia* 96: 35–57. https://doi.org/10.1353/ind.2013.0023
Haenfler, R. 2018. 'The Entrepreneurial Straightedge: How Participation in DIY Music Cultures Translates to Work and Careers'. *Cultural Sociology* 12/2: 140–55. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975517700774
Hatley, B. 2008. 'Indonesian Theatre Ten Years after Reformasi'. *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities* 1/1: 53–72. https://doi.org/10.14203/jissh.v1i1.4
Hodkinson, P. 2005. 'Insider Research in the Study of Youth Cultures'. *Journal of Youth Studies* 8/2: 131–49. https://doi.org/10.1080/13676260500149238
—2016. 'Youth Cultures and the Rest of Life: Subcultures, Post-Subcultures and Beyond'. *Journal of Youth Studies* 19/5: 629–45. https://doi.org/10.1080/13676261.2015.1098778
Kahn-Harris, K. 2007. *Extreme Metal: Music and Culture on the Edge*. Oxford: Berg.
Lukisworo, A. A., and O. R. Sutopo. 2017. 'Metal DIY: Dominasi, Strategi dan Resistensi'. *Jurnal Studi Pemuda* 6/2: 579–89. https://doi.org/10.22146/studipemudaugm.41474
Luvaas, B. 2009. 'Generation DIY: Youth, Class, and the Culture of Indie Production in Digital-Age Indonesia'. PhD dissertation. Los Angeles: University of California.
—2013. *DIY Style: Fashion, Music and Global Digital Cultures*. Oxford: Berg.
Mannheim, K. 1952. 'The Problem of Generations'. In *Karl Mannheim: Essays on the Sociology of Knowledge*, ed. Paul Kecskemeti, 276–320. London: Routledge.
Martin-Iverson, S. 2012. 'Autonomous Youth? Independence and Precariousness in the Indonesian Underground Music Scenes'. *The Asia-Pacific Journal of Anthropology* 13/4: 382–97. https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2011.636062
—2014. 'Running in Circles: Performing Values in the Bandung Do it Yourself Hardcore Scene'. *Ethnomusicology Forum* 23/3: 184–207. https://doi.org/10.1080/17411912.2014.926631
Moog, S. 2020. 'Under the Radar: The Everyday Resistance of Anarchist Punks in Bandung, Indonesia'. PhD dissertation. Fayetteville, AR: University of Arkansas.

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.

Naafs, S., and B. White. 2012. 'Intermediate Generations: Reflections on Indonesian Youth Studies'. *The Asia-Pacific Journal of Anthropology* 13/1: 3–20. https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2012.645796

Parker, L., and P. Nilan. 2013. *Adolescents in Contemporary Indonesia*. London: Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203522073

Richter, M. 2012. *Musical Worlds in Yogyakarta*. Leiden: KITLV Press. https://doi.org/10.26530/OAPEN_420987

Sutopo, O. R. 2019. 'Learning by Doing: Young Indonesian Musicians, Capital and Night Life'. In *Nocturnes: Popular Music and the Night*, ed. Geoff Stahl and Giacomo Botta, 79–94. London: Palgrave. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-99786-5_6

Sutopo, O. R., and P. Nilan. 2018. 'The Constrained Positions of Young Musicians in the Yogyakarta Jazz Community'. *Asian Music* 49/1: 34–57. https://doi.org/10.1353/amu.2018.0002

Sutopo, O. R., P. Nilan and S. Threadgold. 2017. 'Keep the Hope Alive: Young Indonesian Musicians' View of the Future'. *Journal of Youth Studies* 20/5: 549–64. https://doi.org/10.1080/13676261.2016.1241871

Sutopo, O. R., S. Threadgold and P. Nilan. 2017. 'Young Indonesian Musicians, Strategic Social Capital, Reflexivity and Timing'. *Sociological Research Online* 22/3: 186–203. https://doi.org/10.1177/1360780417724063

Tarassi, S. 2018. 'Multi-Tasking and Making a Living from Music: Investigating Music Careers in the Independent Music Scenes in Milan'. *Cultural Sociology* 12/2: 208–23. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975517733221

Threadgold, S. 2018. 'Creativity, Precarity and Illusio: DIY Cultures and "Choosing Poverty"'. *Cultural Sociology* 12/2: 156–73. https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975517722475

Umney, C., and L. Kretsos. 2015. '"That's the Experience": Passion, Work Precarity and Life Transitions among London Jazz Musicians'. *Work and Occupations* 42/3: 313–34. https://doi.org/10.1177/0730888415573634

Wallach, J. 2008. *Modern Noise, Fluid Genres? Popular Music in Indonesia, 1997–2001*. Wisconsin: The University of Wisconsin Press.

Warburton, E. 2016. 'Jokowi and the New Developmentalism'. *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies* 52/3: 297–320. https://doi.org/10.1080/00074918.2016.1249262

Woodman, D., and A. Bennett, eds. 2015. *Youth Cultures, Transitions and Generations: Bridging the Gap in Youth Research*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137377234

Zemke, K. 2007. '"This is My Life": Biography, Identity and Narrative in New Zealand Rap Songs'. *Perfect Beat: The Asia-Pacific Journal of Research into Contemporary Music and Popular Culture* 8/3: 31–51. https://doi.org/10.1558/prbt.v8i3.28699

© Equinox Publishing Ltd 2021.