

Chapter V

CONCLUSION

A. Conclusion

Performance evaluation is significant in supporting organization's strategic management. The performance evaluation may be used to define organization current position and can provide reference for organization to build its strategy based on its current position and its goal. On the other hand performance evaluation can be guidance for organization to improve its performance in gaining its excellence.

The implementing of balanced scorecard as performance measurement in two departments in Atma Jaya Yogyakarta University resulted as presented bellows:

1. Customer perspective

Numbers of students accepted in both departments are almost the same, though communication department received higher application. The ratio between students applied and students accepted in these two departments are still under 50%. This state is still far from ideal as stated by BAN-PT that give standard of student applied-and accepted have to be more than 95% or 0.95.

2. Financial Perspective

University dependency from student increases from 2% to 9% from 2006/2007 to 2008/2009 that reached more than 95%. This is a great number of dependency. It means that university still need to find and maximize other sources in raising fund to support university operational cost.

3. Internal process perspective

This perspective is measured by how excel the internal business process of the faculty in these areas: its academic excellence services, quality and currency of department and efficiency and effectiveness of services such as internal efficiency rate and number of graduated students per year.

a) Academic excellence service

According to the finding and the analysis is good enough since more 60% of respondents students are “satisfy” and “very satisfy”.

b) Quality and currency of department

Communication and management department both received A rank, means that quality of both departments are very good. This also means that the quality and currency of both departments may be viewed as equal.

c) Efficiency and effectiveness of service

The internal efficiency rate in management department is higher than communication department. Even it is higher 1 to 2% than university rate. But this state still far from ideal that is 22% as been required by the government.

4. Learning and growth perspective

a) Employee's satisfaction

The employee's satisfaction in management department is higher than in communication department. But still the gap between numbers of satisfy and dissatisfy employee are still near, since the numbers are very close.

b) Employee's productivity

Lecturers in management department gave higher contribution in research, books, article and journal writing than communication department.

c) Lecturer's competency

Management department has more sufficient of qualified lecturers based on their level of academic compare to communication department. This shall be considered by the department as one improvement that may increase status of the department and innovation by having more qualified lecturers with sufficient level of academic to support organization academic and teaching excellence.

B. Suggestion

1. For the Department, based on this research writer suggest some suggestions, there are:

a. Suggestions for each department according to balanced scorecard four perspectives are as presented in bellow table:

Table 5.1
Suggestion on Management and Communication Department

| No | Perspectives | Management | Communication |
|----|---------------------------------|---|---|
| 1. | Customer perspective | Develop a customer oriented strategy, by improving the quality and marketing of department to gain growth in market share (new students) | Develop a customer oriented strategy, by improving the quality and marketing of department to gain growth in market share (new students) |
| 2. | Financial perspective | finding and maximize other sources of income to support the operational cost of department. | finding and maximize other sources of income to support the operational cost. |
| 3. | Internal process perspective | Improve department service to achieve higher or a more ideal rate of internal efficiency rate that is 22% as been required by government. | Improve department service to achieve higher or a more ideal rate of internal efficiency rate that is 22% as been required by government. |
| 4. | Learning and growth perspective | Management department has a more ideal performance. This performance should be keep even improved by develop a strategy that | Improve the lecturers contribution on research, books, and journals writing Recruit new lecturers with sufficient level of |

| | | | |
|--|--|--|--|
| | | support innovation, learning in skill and knowledge for the employee | academic Upgrading lecturers' competency and level of academic by sending some lecturers to continue their study. |
|--|--|--|--|

- b. Balanced Scorecard approach not only can be implemented in management and communication department as performance measurement system. Also it can be implemented as a tool for a strategic management system.
2. It is hoped that further research may list a more complete measurements and indicators used in the evaluation, to capture a broader area of performance evaluated. This can give benefit for a deeper exploration and more accurate of performance evaluation of the department. It also hoped that next research not only implement balanced scorecard as performance measurement tool but as performance measurement system that can be used to build strategy and evaluate the implementation of balanced scorecard in department.

REFERENCES

- Choo, W. C., 2001, *Environmental Scanning as Information Seeking and Organizational Learning*, Downloaded from: <http://informationr.net/ir/7-1/paper112.html>, Canada.
- Dekawati, I., 2009, *Strategi Pengembangan Perguruan Tinggi Swasta*. Educare: Jurnal Pendidikan dan budaya, Dowloaded from: <http://educare-fkipunla.net>
- De Leao, A. G., Bortolini, E., Hansen, P.B., 2006, *Using The Balanced Scorecard Approach to Design a Performance Management System for Education in Engineering*. Paper downloaded from: <http://www.icee.usm.edu/ICEE/conferences/icee2006/papers/3501.pdf>.
- Gundogar, E., Hocalara, E., Taymazb, I., Cakirb, K., 2009, *A Balanced Scorecard Based Performance Evaluation System: A Case Study at the Sakarya University*, Downloaded from: www.coluteinstitute.com/Programs/San_Antonio_2009/Article%20183.pdf. Turkey.
- Hidayat, A., 2009, *Perspektif Balanced Scorecard dalam Pengelolaan Perguruan Tinggi*. Educare: Jurnal Pendidikan dan budaya, Dowloaded from: <http://educare-fkipunla.net>
- Indrajit, R. E., & Djokopranoto, R., 2006, *Manajemen Perguruan Tinggi Modern*, Andi Publisher, Yogyakarta.
- Kaplan, R. S. & Norton, D. P. 1996. *Balanced Scorecard, Menerapkan Strategi Menjadi Aksi*, Erlangga, Jakarta.
- Karathanos, D. & Karathanos, P. 2006. *Applying the Balanced Scorecard to Education*. Downloaded from: <http://jsofian.files.wordpress.com/2006/12/applying-bsc-in-education.pdf>. Journal of Education for Business.
- Liston B. C., 1999, *Measuring Performance Using a Balanced Scorecard*, Paper for the Educators and Planners: Symphony or Discord Conference. Downloaded from: <http://www.aair.org/jir/1999Papers/liston1.pdf>, Curtin University of Technology.
- Mahsun, M., 2009, *Pengukuran Kinerja Pada Sektor Publik*, Fakultas Ekonomi UGM, Yogyakarta.
- Nayeri, M.D., Mashhadi, M. M., Mohajeri, K., 2008, *Universities Strategic Evaluation Using Balanced Scorecard*, PWASET, Downloaded from: <http://www.waset.org/pwaset/v27/v27-58.pdf>.

Papenhouse, C., Einstein W., 2006, *Measuring Business Excellence*, Vol 10.No 3. Downloaded from: www.emeraldinsight.com.

Prasetyo, T. W. V., *Balanced Scorecard Sebagai Aplikasi dalam Perencanaan Strategi Perguruan Tinggi (Studi Teoritis pada Program Studi Teknik Industri Universitas Widya Mandala Madiun)*, Downloaded from: <http://puslit2.petra.ac.id/ejournal/index.php/jiw/article/view/17053/17016>.

Tjahjono, H. K. 2006, *Budaya Organisasional & Balanced Scorecard; Dimensi Teori dan Praktik*, Unit Penerbitan Fakultas Ekonomi (UPFE), Muhammadiyah University, Jogjakarta.

R.H.N, Imelda., 2004, *Implementasi Balanced Scorecard Pada Organisasi Publik*, downloaded from: <http://puslit.petra.ac.id/~puslit/journals/>.

Ruben, B. D., *Toward a Balanced Scorecard in Higher Education*, Downloaded from: <http://www.odl.rutgers.edu/resources/pdf/score.pdf>.

Suartika, I M., Suwignjo, P., Syairuddin, B., 2007, *Perancangan dan Implementasi Sistem Pengukuran Kinerja dengan Metode Integrated Performance Systems: Studi Kasus Jurusan Teknik Mesin Universitas Mataram*, JURNAL TEKNIK INDUSTRI VOL. 9, NO. 2, DESEMBER 2007: 131-143.

KUESIONER

Saya, Hendriane Namotemo, mahasiswa program Magister Manajemen UAJY. Saat ini saya sedang melakukan penelitian mengenai "***Implementation of Balanced Scorecard in Two Study Programs in Atma Jaya Yogyakarta University***". Saya meminta bantuan bapak/ibu/sdr untuk mau mengisi kuesioner di bawah ini. Atas kesediaannya saya ucapkan terima kasih.

Isilah pernyataan dibawah ini dengan menggunakan tanda silang (X) untuk pernyataan yang sesuai:

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Jenis Kelamin <input type="checkbox"/> Perempuan | <input type="checkbox"/> Laki-laki <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Usia | <input type="checkbox"/> < 30 tahun (dibawah 30 tahun) <input type="checkbox"/> 31 – 40 tahun <input type="checkbox"/> 41 – 50 tahun <input type="checkbox"/> <50 tahun (diatas 50 tahun) |
| 3. Status belum kawin | <input type="checkbox"/> kawin <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Lama Bekerja | <input type="checkbox"/> <5 tahun (dibawah 5 tahun) <input type="checkbox"/> 6-10 tahun <input type="checkbox"/> 11 – 15 tahun <input type="checkbox"/> > 15 tahun (diatas 15 tahun) |

Isilah pertanyaan dibawah ini dengan menggunakan tanda centang (✓) atau silang (X) sesuai dengan jawaban Anda.

- | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|
| STP | : Jika Anda Sangat Tidak Puas |
| TP | : Jika Anda Tidak Puas |
| RR | : Jika Anda Ragu-ragu |
| P | : Jika Anda Puas |
| SP | : Jika Anda Sangat Puas |

| No. | Pernyataan | STP | TP | RR | P | SP |
|-----|--|-----|----|----|---|----|
| 1. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap system kompensasi yang diberikan organisasi | | | | | |
| 2. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap tanggapan organisasi terhadap keinginan dan kebutuhan pegawai | | | | | |
| 3. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda bekerja di Fakultas ini | | | | | |
| 4. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap penghargaan dari organisasi bagi karyawan yang berprestasi | | | | | |
| 5. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap gaji yang diterima bila dibandingkan dengan beban kerja yang diberikan | | | | | |
| 6. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap kondisi lingkungan kerja Anda saat ini | | | | | |
| 7. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap hubungan dengan rekan kerja | | | | | |
| 8. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap hubungan kerja dengan atasan di tempat Anda bekerja | | | | | |
| 9. | Seberapa besar tingkat kepuasan Anda terhadap kesempatan yang diberikan organisasi untuk pengembangan potensi karyawan | | | | | |

KUESIONER

Saya, Hendriane Namotemo, mahasiswa program Magister Manajemen UAJY. Saat ini saya sedang melakukan penelitian mengenai "*Implementation of Balanced Scorecard in Two Study Programs in Atma Jaya Yogyakarta University*". Saya meminta bantuan bapak/ibu/sdr untuk mau mengisi kuesioner di bawah ini. Atas kesediaannya saya ucapan terima kasih.

Isilah pernyataan dibawah ini dengan menggunakan tanda silang (X) untuk pernyataan yang sesuai:

1. Jenis Kelamin Laki-laki
Perempuan
2. Angkatan

Isilah pertanyaan dibawah ini dengan menggunakan tanda silang (X) sesuai dengan jawaban Anda.

- | | |
|-----|--|
| STS | : Jika Anda Sangat Tidak Setuju |
| TS | : Jika Anda Tidak Setuju |
| RR | : Jika Anda Ragu-ragu |
| S | : Jika Anda Setuju |
| SS | : Jika Anda Sangat Setuju |

| No. | Deskripsi | STS | TS | RR | S | SS |
|-----|--|-----|----|----|---|----|
| 1. | Saya puas dengan sistem perkuliahan di fakultas ini | | | | | |
| 2. | Saya puas dengan metode perkuliahan di fakultas ini | | | | | |
| 3. | Di fakultas ini rata-rata dosen menggunakan buku referensi terbaru. | | | | | |
| 4. | Saya merasa memperoleh banyak manfaat dengan kuliah di fakultas ini | | | | | |
| 5. | Dosen di fakultas ini selalu memulai dan mengakhiri kuliah tepat waktu | | | | | |
| 6. | Dosen di fakultas ini selalu melaksanakan | | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|-----|---|--|--|--|--|
| | kuliah sesuai dengan rencana kuliah/silabi | | | | |
| 7. | Dosen di fakultas ini selalu memberikan motivasi belajar kepada saya | | | | |
| 8. | Dengan kuliah di fakultas ini, saya terlatih untuk bisa mempelajari dan memahami buku-buku dan bacaan lain secara mandiri | | | | |
| 9. | Dengan kuliah di fakultas ini, saya terbiasa berfikir secara sistematis, ilmiah dan rasional. | | | | |
| 10 | Sistem perkuliahan di fakultas ini sering mengadakan diskusi sehingga saya terlatih untuk mengungkapkan pendapat dengan baik. | | | | |
| 11. | Saya puas dengan system layanan administrasi akademik di fakultas ini | | | | |
| 12. | Saya puas dengan system layanan administrasi umum dan keuangan di fakultas ini | | | | |
| 13. | Saya puas dengan system layanan administrasi perpustakaan di fakultas ini | | | | |
| 14. | Saya puas dengan system layanan administrasi pendukung (lab. Bahasa, lab. komputer, dll) di fakultas ini. | | | | |
| 15. | Saya puas dengan bimbingan dan konsultasi dosen. | | | | |
| 16. | Di fakultas ini sering menyelenggarkan seminar, stadium general, dan symposium untuk mahasiswa. | | | | |
| 17. | Di fakultas ini sering menyelenggarakan kursus dan pelatihan keterampilan untuk mahasiswa | | | | |
| 18. | Kegiatan intra maupun ekstra kampus yang ada di fakultas ini, melatih saya untuk dapat | | | | |

| | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | berorganisasi dan menumbuhkan jiwa kepemimpinan dalam diri saya | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|



LECTURERS OF MANAGEMENT STUDY PROGRAM

| No | NAME | JABATAN AKADEMIK | EDUCATION HISTORY |
|----|--|----------------------|---|
| 1 | Ami Rosa Widjaja, Dra., MBA. | Asisten Ahli / IIa | Dra. - UAJY, MBA - Western Michigan University USA |
| 2 | Budi Suprapto, MBA., Ph.D. | Asisten Ahli / IIb | Drs. UAJY, MBA - AI T Bangkok, Ph.D Nanzan University, Jepang |
| 3 | C. Jarot Priyogutomo, Drs., MBA. | Asisten Ahli / IIa | Drs. - UAJY, MBA - Murray State university USA |
| 4 | J. Sukmawati, MM., Dr., Prof. | Guru Besar / IVd | Dra. - UAJY, MM - UGM, Dr. - UGM |
| 5 | A. Jatmiko Wibowo, SE, SIP., MSF. | Lektor / IIic | SE - UAJY, SIP - UGM, MSF - University of Illinois at Urbana Campaign, USA |
| 6 | D. Koesnohartono, Drs., MM.. | Lektor / IIic | Drs. - UAJY, MM - UGM; S3 - Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya |
| 7 | Fandy Tijptono, SE., M.Com. | Lektor / IIic | SE - UGM, M.Com. - UNSW Australia, S3 - UNSW Australia |
| 8 | Felix Wisnu Isdanyadi, Drs., MBA. | Lektor / IIic | Drs. - UAJY, MBA - Charles Sturt University Australia |
| 9 | Gunawan Jiwanto, Drs., MBA. | Lektor / IIic | Drs. - UAJY, MBA - Ball State University USA |
| 10 | Ign. Sukirno, Drs., MS. | Lektor / IIic | Drs. - UAJY, MS - UGM |
| 11 | J. Elyawati, Dra., MM. | Lektor Kepala / IIid | Dra. - UAJY, MM - UGM, S3 - UGM |
| 12 | J. Sudarsono, Drs., MS. | Lektor IIic | Drs. - UGM, MS - UGM, S3 - Universitas Airlangga Surabaya |
| 13 | M. Parmawa Putranta, Drs., MBA., Ph.D. | Lektor IIic | Drs. - UGM, MBA - Edith Cowan University Australia, Ph.D - University of Notre Dame Australia |
| 14 | P. Didit Krishnadevara, Drs., MM. | Lektor Kepala / IIid | Drs. - UGM, MM - UGM |
| 15 | Siswanto, Drs., M. Sc. | Lektor / IIid | Drs. - UAJY, M.Sc. - Michigan University USA |
| 16 | Th. Diah Widiaastuti, SE., M. Si. | Lektor / IIic | SE - UAJY, M.Si - UGM |
| 17 | W. Mahestu NK., SE., M.Scib. | Lektor / IIid | SE - UAJY, M.Sicb - University of Groningen Belanda, S3- University Western Australia |
| 18 | C. Handoyo Wibisono, Drs., MM., Dr. | Lektor Kepala / IVc | Drs. - UAJY, MM - UGM; S3 - Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya |
| 19 | Dorothea Wahyu A., SE., M.T., Dr. | Lektor Kepala / IVa | SE - UAJY, M.T - ITB Bandung, Dr. UGM |

| | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|----------------------|---|
| 20 | E. Kusumadmo, Drs., MM, Ph.D. | Lektor Kepala / IV b | Drs. - UAJY, MM- UGM, Dr. - University Utara Malaysia |
| 21 | EF. Slamet Sarwoho, MBA., Dr. | Lektor Kepala / IV a | Drs. - UAJY, Mba. - Murray State University USA, DBA - Murdoch University Australia |
| 22 | FX. Suwarto, MS., Dr., Prof. | Guru Besar / IV d | Drs. - UPN, MS - UNPAD, Dr. - UNPAD |
| 23 | MF. Shellyana Junaedi, M.Si. Dr. | Lektor Kepala / IV b | SE - UAJY, M.Si - UGM, Dr. - UGM |
| 24 | Th. Agung M Harsiwij, SE., M.Si. | Lektor Kepala / IV a | SE - UGM, M.Si. - UGM |

LECTURERS OF SCIENCE OF COMMUNICATION STUDY PROGRAM

| No | NAME | EDUCATION HISTORY |
|----|-----------------------------|--|
| 1 | Lukas Suryanto Ispandriarno | Drs- UGM, MA-Ateneo De Manila University, Philippines, Ph.D-Ilmenau, Germany |
| 2 | Yudi Perbawantingsih | Dra-UGM, M.Si-UJ, Ph.D-Ilmenau, Germany |
| 3 | Josep J. Darmawan | Drs-UGM, MA-University Sains, Malaysia |
| 4 | Ign. Agus Putranto | Drs-UGM, M.Si-Universitas Padjajaran Bandung |
| 5 | MC. Ninik Sri Rejeki | Dra-UGM, M.Si-IPB, Dr-Universitas Indonesia |
| 6 | Setio Budi HH | Drs-Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia |
| 7 | Mario Antonius Bitromo | Drs-Universitas Sebelas Maret Solo, MA-Ateneo De Manila University Philippines, Ph.D-Curtin University Australia |
| 8 | Dina Listiorini | S.Sos-Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia |
| 9 | G. Arum Yudawarti | SIP-UGM, M.Mktg Comcn-University of Canberra, Australia, Ph.D-Monash, Australia |
| 10 | Bonaventura Satya Bharata | SIP-UGM, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia |
| 11 | Yunita Wahyuningrum | S.Sos-Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia, Dr-Universitas Indonesia |
| 12 | F. Anita Herawati | SIP-UGM, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia |
| 13 | Danarka Sasangka | SIP-UGM, S2-Monash University, Australia |
| 14 | Ike Devi Sulistyaningtyas | S.Sos-Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, M.Si-Universitas Indonesia |
| 15 | Bambang Wiratmojo | S.Sos-Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, MA-Ilmenau University, Germany |
| 16 | Meylani Yo | S.Sos-UAJY |
| 17 | Prof. Andre A. Hardjana | MA-State University of New York at Buffalo, Ph.D-University of Wisconsin, Madison, Amerika Serikat |

**DAFTAR PEGAWAI FAKULTAS EKONOMI
UNIVERSITAS ATMA JAYA YOGYAKARTA**

| No | Nama | NPP | Jabatan | Golongan | Pendidikan Terakhir |
|----|----------------------------|-----------|---------------------|----------|---------------------|
| 1 | Y. Artiyyana | 04.89.303 | Staff | II/B | SMEA |
| 2 | YR. Budi Nuryana | 05.93.443 | Staff | II/A | SMA |
| 3 | Drs. A. Sri Wibowo | 11.87.259 | Kabag. TU | IV/A | S1 |
| 4 | Cr. Isti Rochati | 02.85.164 | Kasubag. Uj. & Yud. | II/B | SMA |
| 5 | A. Aditya Octabriani, SIP. | 02.03.752 | Staff | II/B | S1 |
| 6 | Th. M. Murdiyati | 11.87.254 | Staff | II/B | SMA |
| 7 | V. Winaryati | 05.93.441 | Staff | II/A | SMA |
| 8 | Y. susiloharso | 11.83.114 | Kasubag. Perkuif. | II/C | D3 |
| 9 | Agustinus Haryanto | 07.95.583 | Staff | II/A | SMA |
| 10 | Ign. Parlan | 11.95.569 | Staff | II/C | SMA |
| 11 | E. Harti Astuti | 02.85.172 | Kasubag. Umum | II/B | SMA |
| 12 | L. supariyono | 11.87.255 | Staff | II/B | SMA |
| 13 | E. Widianingsih | 02.85.150 | Staff | II/B | SMEA |
| 14 | G. Adi Pramono | 01.94.508 | Staff | II/B | SMA |
| 15 | Cosmas Dwijarta K., SE. | 10.01.721 | Staff | II/C | S1 |
| 16 | A. Taupan Hariyadi, A.Md. | 07.00.680 | Staff | II/C | D3 |

Data Karyawan Fakultas Komunikasi
Universitas Atma Jaya

| No | Name | Gol |
|----|------------------------|------|
| 1 | Y. Haryono | IIIb |
| 2 | Y. Sudarmanto | IIIb |
| 3 | F. Mujiarti | IIIb |
| 4 | MM. Tri Hesti Andriani | IIIb |
| 5 | Y. Siyamta, SP | Iva |
| 6 | Artati Sukarnasari | IIIa |
| 7 | Ign. Tri Sujoko | Iic |
| 8 | E. Sri Kristini | IIIb |
| 9 | P. Maryono | IIia |
| 10 | Suwito Mulyatno | IIib |
| 11 | Elisabeth Sulastiyanti | IIIb |
| 12 | Yudi Prihartanto, ST | IIIa |
| 13 | Th. Aji Baruno, S.Sos | IIIa |

**Student of
communication**

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 |
| 4 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 |
| 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 |
| 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 |
| 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 2 |
| 2 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 5 |
| 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 2 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 |
| 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 5 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 |
| 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 2 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 |
| 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 5 |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | . | 4 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | |
| 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | |
| 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | . | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | |
| 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | |
| 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 2 | |
| 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | |
| 3 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | |
| 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | |

Management student's

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 |
| 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 2 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 3 |
| 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 2 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 3 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 4 |
| 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 2 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 |
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 5 |
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 2 | 1 |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 |
| 2 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 5 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 2 |
| 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 2 |
| 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 2 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 |
| 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 2 |
| 2 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 |

Communication Department employee's response

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 3 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 2 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |